



ORGANIZATIONAL DEVELOPMENT AS A CONSTRUCT OF TEACHER EFFECTIVENESS IN PUBLIC SECONDARY SCHOOLS OF PANABO CITY DIVISION

Jocelyn B. Eyorcadas¹, Aurelio S. Gomez Jr., EdD²

¹ Student, Graduate School, The Rizal Memorial Colleges, Inc.

² Faculty, Graduate School, The Rizal Memorial Colleges, Inc.

Article DOI: <https://doi.org/10.36713/epra16818>

DOI No: 10.36713/epra16818

ABSTRACT

The study explored the relationship between organizational development and teacher effectiveness. This claim was substantiated. However, this had never been explored specifically in the local setting. With this, the study determined the extent of organizational development and teacher effectiveness in public secondary schools of Panabo City Division. Also, it investigated the association of the involved variables and the domains of organizational development that significantly influence teacher effectiveness. With the use of probability sampling, 150 secondary teachers in the public schools were selected as the respondents. Utilizing the descriptive-correlational survey method, the data collated were analyzed through the use of Mean, Product-Moment correlation and Regression Analysis. Results revealed that there was an extensive organizational development and a very extensive teacher effectiveness. Furthermore, there was a significant relationship between the two variables. Moreover, all domains of organizational development were found to have significantly influenced teacher effectiveness. Based on the findings, it was further suggested that higher officials in the Department of Education may identify means on how to help the school heads achieve organizational development leading to teacher effectiveness. More so, future researchers may further explore the involved variables considering other factors and research methods.

KEYWORDS: Organizational development, teacher effectiveness, descriptive correlation, Panabo City Division, Philippines

INTRODUCTION

Teachers are crucial to the education system, and schools are only as good as the teachers within them (Darling-Hammond, 2015). In fact, teacher effectiveness is defined as a teacher's ability to utilize approaches, strategies, connections to students, and a particular set of attitudes that lead to improved student learning and achievement (Strong, Ward, & Grant, 2011). Evaluating the effectiveness of teachers has changed over time due to increasing state and federal attention to school-level and classroom-level accountability for student learning. According to Carrero (2016), these evaluation systems are only as good as their potential to increase teacher effectiveness. However, the demanding nature of teaching restrained teachers to be effective.

In Zimbabwe, teachers tend to be ineffective in teaching due to identified reasons. Mupa and Chinooneka (2015) revealed that there is such decay in schools in Zimbabwe. The study found out that teachers do not employ a variety of teaching methods. They do not prepare a variety of media for use in the teaching and learning. Teachers' instructional materials are limited to textbooks and syllabuses and do not go beyond that. Pupils learn in harsh and uncondusive teaching and learning environments and there is low morale among teachers. Parental support in terms of extra materials such as text books and revision books is very low. Only a small proportion of parents guide their children on homework. Teachers do not provide extra lessons for their children. Schools lack adequate textbooks, revision books and resource books to extend children's knowledge.



In the Philippines, ineffective teaching is evident on the performance of the students. In the international education assessments, the country ranked as the lowest and second to the lowest in reading and in mathematics. Findings from a new World Bank report focusing on the East Asia and Pacific region found that teachers in the Philippines have one of the most ineffective methods in Southeast Asia and teacher training programs targeted at them have failed to improve their mastery of content. Teachers' lack of mastery of what they teach and teacher absenteeism have contributed to the Philippines' high learning poverty. It was found that 40% of students in the country based on the survey said that they had teachers who were sometimes or often missing in the class (Chi, 2023).

In the Division of Panabo City Division, it was observed that teachers were overburdened with too many responsibilities and accountabilities that restrained them to perform well affecting their effectiveness in teaching. The demanding system of the Department of Education confused teachers of their main responsibilities. In fact, they prioritized administrative works than teaching due to urgent reports. Teachers were bombarded with heavy workload, tight schedules, and high-stress levels. More so, a lack of access to quality professional development hindered their growth, resulting to inefficient and ineffective teaching skills.

However, the mentioned circumstances were solely observed, as the researcher had not encountered any existing study focusing on teacher effectiveness within the local context, particularly considering organizational development. Given this scenario, the researcher was driven to delve into the status of organizational learning and its impact on the effectiveness of teachers, specifically within the public secondary schools of Panabo City Division. Moreover, the objective was to explore the relationship between these two variables.

This endeavor also offered valuable insights to policymakers in formulating policies, programs, interventions, projects, and activities that could encourage all school leaders to look and aim for organizational development. This effort aimed to support teachers in capacitating them to be effective in teaching. Additionally, the researcher intended to present this study in various local, national, and international forums, with the ultimate goal of publishing it in a journal indexed by Scopus.

METHODOLOGY

Research Design

In this research, a quantitative approach was utilized, precisely employing a descriptive correlational technique. Quantitative research involves gathering numerical data and then applying mathematical analysis, frequently integrating statistical tools. This methodology is employed to clarify and offer insights into particular problems or phenomena (Apuke, 2017). In the realm of descriptive correlational studies, the emphasis is on delineating variables and the inherent relationships that emerge among them (Davis, 2021).

Descriptive research involves a non-interventionist approach by the researcher, observing variables without any manipulation. Its principal aim is to offer a comprehensive comprehension of the fundamental attributes of these variables, as highlighted by Korrapati (2016). Conversely, a correlational study aims to ascertain if a relationship exists between two variables. According to Kabir (2016), this entails assessing whether a change, either an increase or decrease, in one variable is connected to a corresponding increase or decrease in the other.

This study fell under the quantitative category as it depended on numerical data for analysis and interpretation. It was descriptive in nature as it sought to assess both the organizational development and teacher effectiveness. Furthermore, this academic undertaking was considered correlational because it examined the association between the organizational development and teacher effectiveness of teachers in public secondary schools of Panabo City Division.

Respondents and Sampling

A total of 150 public secondary teachers were invited to participate in this study. According to Hair et al. (2018), it was suggested that a minimum of 50 samples was required for simple regression analysis, and typically around 100 samples sufficed for most research scenarios. Therefore, having 150 respondents was more than sufficient to fulfill the objectives of this study.



In selecting the study's sample, a two-staged cluster sampling, a form of probability sampling, was utilized. This sampling method allows for determining the probability or likelihood of inclusion for each item. Essentially, every member of the population has an equal and independent chance of being part of the sample (Ragab & Arisha, 2018). In research, cluster sampling is a widely adopted technique that involves dividing the population into clusters. A cluster comprises unique units, forming exhaustive and mutually exclusive subsets (Thomas, 2020). The two-stage cluster sampling is employed due to the random selection of a sample from each specified cluster or division. In the context of this study, all secondary teachers from the public secondary schools in Panabo City Division were taken into account.

The inclusion and exclusion criteria for this study specified the selection of secondary teachers with a minimum of 2 years of teaching experience. This criterion was essential as it allowed teachers with at least a 2-year tenure in public schools to effectively evaluate the organizational development and its impact on teacher effectiveness. Additionally, participants who felt uneasy or uncomfortable answering the survey questionnaire had the option to voluntarily withdraw from participating in the study. They did not face any pressure to continue their involvement, and their decision to withdraw was fully respected, emphasizing the paramount importance of the respondents' welfare in the study's conduct.

Research Instruments

Regarding data collection, this study utilized a customized survey questionnaire. The questionnaire used in this project had two distinct sets. The initial set centered on evaluating the organizational development, while the subsequent set focused on assessing teacher effectiveness.

Organizational Development. The organizational development questionnaire was adapted from Mines Action Canada Youth to Youth Network, (n.d). The instrument consisted of 25 items. It comprised the following indicators, namely: vision and mission (1-5), organizational structure (1-5), stakeholder engagement and retention (1-5), technology and infrastructure (1-5) and organizational renewal (1-5). The questionnaire was subjected to a pilot testing having a result of .74 suggesting that the items have relatively high internal consistency.

Teacher Effectiveness. The teacher effectiveness questionnaire was adapted from Akram (2018). The tool had a total of 26 items. It had five indicators, namely: subject matter knowledge (1-6), instructional planning and strategies (1-6), assessment (1-5), learning environment (1-6), and effective communication (1-3). The questionnaire was subjected to a pilot testing having a result of .71 suggesting that the items have relatively high internal consistency.

The instruments employed in this study were tailored to align with the study's objectives. The researcher incorporated and consolidated all feedback, comments, and suggestions provided by the adviser, panel members, and expert validators to enhance and refine the research tools, thereby ensuring the achievement of construct validity.

Data Analysis

For more comprehensive interpretation and analysis of the data, the following statistical tools were utilized.

Weighted Mean. This was used to measure the extent of organizational development and teacher effectiveness.

Pearson r. This was utilized to determine the relationships between organizational development and teacher effectiveness.

Regression Analysis. This was employed to determine the significant influence of organizational development on teacher effectiveness.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Presented in this chapter are the findings based on the results of data gathered, the conclusions drawn from the findings and the recommendations for consideration.



Findings

The main focus of the study was to determine the significance of the relationship between organizational development and teacher effectiveness in public secondary schools. The study was conducted in the selected secondary schools in Panabo City Division. There were one hundred fifty (150) secondary teachers who participated in this study. Descriptive correlational method of research was used in this study utilizing adopted research instruments. The said instruments were validated by the panel of experts and subjected to pilot testing before it was made ready for administration. Mean, Pearson Product Correlation of Coefficient, and Regression Analysis were the statistical tools used in analyzing the data. The hypotheses raised in this study were tested at 0.05 level of significance.

The extent of organizational development is extensive which means that organizational development is oftentimes evident. Descriptively labeled as "extensive," this indicates that organizational development is frequently observable, highlighting its significant role in shaping the overall functioning and effectiveness of the organization.

Meanwhile, the extent of teacher effectiveness is very extensive which means that it is always evident. This suggests that teacher effectiveness is consistently observable, highlighting its significant impact on the educational environment and student outcomes.

It was found out that there is a significant relationship between organizational development and teacher effectiveness. The hypothesis of no significant relationship between organizational development and teacher effectiveness was rejected. This underscores the importance of organizational development in influencing teacher effectiveness.

More so, it was revealed that all the domains of organizational development significantly influence the teacher effectiveness. The findings indicate that all domains of organizational development play a significant role in shaping teacher effectiveness. This underscores the collective impact of various organizational factors on fostering an environment conducive to effective teaching practices and student success.

Conclusions

Based on the findings of this study, the following conclusions were offered:

The extent of organizational development means that it is oftentimes evident in the school. In fact, all dimensions are oftentimes evident, namely, vision and mission, organizational structure, stakeholder engagement and retention, technology and infrastructure, and organizational renewal.

Meanwhile, the extent of teacher effectiveness is always evident. Apparently, subject matter knowledge, instructional planning and strategies, and assessment are found to be always evident while learning environment and effective communication are found to be oftentimes evident.

Based on the findings, organizational development and teacher effectiveness are related. All domains of organizational development are linked to the teacher effectiveness.

Also, organizational development significantly influenced teacher effectiveness. In fact, all domains of organizational development, namely, vision and mission, organizational structure, stakeholder engagement and retention, technology and infrastructure, and organizational renewal significantly influence teacher effectiveness by registering a p-value of .000 which is less than .05 in the level of significance. This leads to the rejection of the null hypothesis. Further, the result indicates that for every unit increase in the five domains of organizational development, the teacher effectiveness will increase.

Reflecting a strong and positive correlation between organizational development and teacher effectiveness, this aligns closely with Senge's Organizational Learning theory (1990). This theory posits that within an organization, individuals continuously learn and enhance their capabilities to foster innovation. It underscores the role of organizations in facilitating ongoing learning and improvement. While not originally specific to education, it has been effectively applied in educational settings, with its principles profoundly impacting teacher effectiveness.

Wind (2022) highlighted Organizational Learning theory as a branch of organizational studies focused on understanding how organizations acquire and utilize knowledge to enhance their performance. It delves into the processes, mechanisms, and factors influencing organizational learning, providing various conceptual frameworks and



models to elucidate and predict the effects of organizational learning on outcomes such as innovation, adaptability, competitiveness, and sustainability.

Recommendations

The following suggestions were offered based on the conclusions of the study:

The higher officials in the Department of Education may continue to prioritize initiatives aimed at further enhancing organizational structures and processes. This may involve ongoing training and development programs for school administrators and staff, focusing on areas such as leadership skills, collaboration, and stakeholder engagement. Additionally, efforts to support teacher effectiveness may be reinforced through targeted professional development opportunities, mentorship programs, and resources that promote innovative instructional strategies and pedagogical approaches. By nurturing a strong organizational culture and fostering continuous improvement in teaching practices, DepEd may sustain and further elevate the quality of education provided, ultimately benefiting both educators and students alike.

Moreover, school heads may further capitalize on these strengths, it is essential to foster a culture of continuous improvement and collaboration among staff members. This can be achieved through regular professional development sessions that focus on refining instructional strategies, leveraging technology effectively, and enhancing communication and collaboration within the school community. Additionally, providing ample resources and support for teachers to innovate and adapt their teaching methods to meet the evolving needs of students is crucial.

Furthermore, for teachers, the recognition of extensive organizational development and very extensive teacher effectiveness underscores the importance of continuing professional growth and collaboration within the school community. It is vital for teachers to actively engage in professional development opportunities provided by the school, focusing on areas such as instructional planning, assessment practices, and effective communication strategies. Additionally, embracing a growth mindset and being open to feedback from colleagues and administrators can further enhance teacher effectiveness.

Lastly, future researchers may delve deeper into the specific mechanisms and practices that contribute to organizational development within educational institutions, as well as the factors that enhance teacher effectiveness. Utilizing mixed-methods approaches, such as surveys, interviews, and classroom observations, may provide a comprehensive understanding of the interactions between organizational structures, teacher practices, and student outcomes. Moreover, longitudinal studies may track the long-term impact of organizational development initiatives on teacher effectiveness and student achievement. By shedding light on these dynamics, future research may inform evidence-based practices and policies aimed at promoting effective teaching and organizational excellence in educational settings.

REFERENCES

1. Aada, K. (2020). *Insight on planning and assessing the teaching-learning process*. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1263944.pdf>
2. Adiguzel, Z. (2020). *Examining strategic fit and innovation in terms of competitive strategies and knowledge management*. <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/338302170>
3. Adler, J. & Venkat, H. (2020). *Subject matter knowledge within mathematical knowledge for teaching*. https://link.springer.com/10.1007/978-3-030-15789-0_98
4. Agalday, B. & Dagli, A. (2021). *The investigation of the relations between paternalistic leadership, organizational creativity and organizational dissent*. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/2165069>
5. Aguilar, S. (2017). *Promoting effective assessment for learning methods to increase student motivation in schools in India*. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1148914.pdf>
6. Agyapong, K. (2017). *Internal control activities as a tool for financial management in the public sector: a case study of ghana post company limited*. <http://digitalcommons.unl.edu/jade/31>
7. Ahmady, G., Mehrpour, M., & Nikooravesh, A. (2023). *Organizational structure*. <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/308736877>
8. Ahmed, G., Tayyub, M., Ismail, R. (2020). *Effects of classroom environment for improving students' learning at secondary level in Punjab Province, Pakistan*. <https://scienceacademique.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Effects-of-Classroom-Environment-for-Improving-Students-Learning.pdf>



9. Ajmal, F., Durrani, R. & Mohammad, N. (2021). Teaching effectiveness: a university students' perspective. <https://www.pjer.org/index.php/pjer/article/download/332/113>
10. Akram, M. (2018). Development and validation of school teacher effectiveness questionnaire. <https://www.ue.edu.pk/jrre/articles/article4.pdf>
11. Akram, M. (2019). Relationship between students' perceptions of teacher effectiveness and student achievement at secondary school level. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1229453.pdf>
12. Akram, M., Munir, F. & Bilal, A. (2021). Effect of teacher performance evaluation on school effectiveness. [https://doi.org/10.36902/sjesr-vol4-iss1-2021\(431-439\)](https://doi.org/10.36902/sjesr-vol4-iss1-2021(431-439))
13. Alexia, S. & Arnold, G. (2022). Mintzberg organizational structure. <https://study.com/learn/lesson/henry-mintzberg-model>
14. Alfes, K., Antunes, B. & Shantz, A. (n.d.). The management of volunteers – What can human resources do? A review and research agenda. <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/74244103.pdf>
15. Ali, F. & Ahamat, A. (2022). Effects of innovation and creativity on human resources practices in ministry of interior UAE. <https://tianjindaxuexuebao.com/dashboard/uploads/39.HB6ST.pdf>
16. Annan, J., Back, S. & Lim, H. (2023). A study on teacher evaluation system to improve professional development among junior high school teachers in Ghana. <https://infinitypress.info/index.php/jsss/article/download/2182/845>
17. Anderson, D. (2017). Organizational development; the process of leading organizational change. <https://www.scirp.org>
18. Anderson, C. & Palm, T. (2016). The impact of formative assessment on student achievement: A study of the effects of changes to classroom practice after a comprehensive professional development programme. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0959475216302900>
19. Anika, F. (2023). Stakeholder management: Building successful relationships. <https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/stakeholder-management-building-successful-fariha-anika>
20. Anos, J. et al. (2020). Financial management of micro, small, and medium enterprises in Cebu, Philippines. <https://www.eajournals.org>
21. Aparajeya. (2016). Communication between teachers and students. <https://www.toppr.com/bytes/failure-communication-between-teachers-and-students/>
22. Ara, A. (n.d.). Mastery over the subject. <https://wtcpu.org.in/olms/lesson/1586971149.pdf>
23. Arbab, A. & Mahdi, O. (2018). Human resources management practices and organizational excellence in public organizations. <https://bibliotekanauki.pl/articles/404913.pdf>
24. Arshab, M., Ahmed, G. & Tayyab, M. (2019). Assessing the effects of school support facilities on academic achievement at Punjab education foundation partner schools. https://european-science.com/eojnss_proc/article/viewfile/5797/2680
25. Austin, N. (2023). Leadership and psychological safety: Fostering a culture of trust and innovation. <https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/leadership-psychological-safety-fostering-culture-nathan>
26. Awan, M. (2018). Comparative study of availability and quality of physical facilities in public and private schools in the Punjab. http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/JEE/PDF/9_v28_1_18.pdf
27. Ayoko, O. & Ashkanasy, N. (2020). The physical environment of office work: Future open plan offices. <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/0312896220921913>
28. Aytikin, G. (2020). Exploration of principals' leadership qualities and their associations with a school learning environment and school outcomes. <https://huskiecommons.lib.niu.edu/allgraduate-thesisdissertations/6833>
29. Banda, N. (2022). The role of strategic leadership in organizational development. <https://www.gssrr.org/index.php/journalofbasicandapplied/article/view/14028>
30. Bang, H., & Midelfart, T. N. (2017). What characterizes effective management teams? A research-based approach. <https://doi.org/10.1037/cpb0000098>
31. Barakat, N. (2021). The relationship between organizational agility, human resources flexibility and employee well-being: the mediation role of work-life balance. <https://theses.hal.science/tel-04001997/document>
32. Bastos, C. (2021). Proposed methodology for identifying strategic information in information-intensive organizations. <https://www.revistasg.uff.br/sg/article/view/1749/1549>
33. Battisti, E., Alfiero, S. & Leonidou, E. (2022). Remote working and digital transformation during the COVID-19 pandemic: Economic-financial impacts and psychological drivers for employees. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC9186428/>
34. Baydillah, P. (2021). Importance of communication in education. <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/354968194>
35. Beer, P. & Mulder, R. (2020). The effects of technological developments on work and their implications for continuous vocational education and training: A systematic review. <https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fpsyg.2020.00918/full>
36. Bekanwah, D., Müdom, D., & Ukoha, O. (2020). Organizational structure and business growth in manufacturing firms in Nigeria. <https://www.ijaar.org/articles/v6n5/sms/ijaar-sms-v6n5-may20-p20.pdf>



37. Besharati, N. (2016). *Evaluating development effectiveness: assessing and comparing the impact of education interventions in South Africa.* <https://wiredspace.wits>.
38. Bhebhe, S. (2020). *Organisational structure and teachers' performance.* <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/338505117>
39. Bienia, E. (2016). *Preschool partnerships: how teachers make sense of their experiences.* <https://repository.library.northeastern.edu/files/neu:cj82nc92v/fulltext.pdf>
40. Bipp, T. et al. (2017). *The effect of subconscious performance goals on academic performance.* <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220973.2016.1252998>
41. Blazar, D. & Kraft, M. (2017). *Teacher and teaching effects on students' attitudes and behaviors.* <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ej1128763.pdf>
42. Booth-Bell, D. et al. (2021). *Governance theory and board diversity, where do the rationales for board diversity and governance theories converge?* <https://www.igbr.org/wp-content/uploads/articles/>
43. Bostjancic, E. & Slana, Z. (2018). *The role of talent management comparing medium-sized and large companies – major challenges in attracting and retaining talented employees.* <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6156250/>
44. Boucher, K. (2023). *What's the difference between mission and vision statements?* <https://www.podium.com/article/mission-vs-vision-statements/>
45. Usman, Y. & Madudili, C. (2019). *Evaluation of the effect of learning environment on student's academic performance in Nigeria.* <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED602386.pdf>
46. Van Dijck, J. & T. Poell (2018). *Social media platforms and education.* <https://deliverypdf.ssrn.com/delivery.php>
47. Villa, A. (2023). *The importance of streamlining processes for efficiency*
48. Van der Voordt, T. & Jensen, P. (2021). *The impact of healthy workplaces on employee satisfaction, productivity and costs.* <https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/JCRE-03-2021-0012/full/html>
49. Vicente, V. (2023). *Evaluating internal control deficiencies.* <https://www.auditboard.com/blog/tips-evaluating-internal-control-deficiencies/>
50. Vischer, J. & Wifi, M. (2017). *The effect of workplace design on quality of life at work.* <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/311994835>
51. Walsh, K. (2016). *Managing a budget in healthcare professional education.* <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4866369/>
52. Wang, H., Gong, Q. & Wang, S. (2017). *Information processing structures and decision making delays in MRP and JIT.* <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0925527317300750>
53. Weston, C., Ferris, J. & Finkelstein, A. (2017). *Leading change: An organizational development role for educational developers.* <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ej1146158.pdf>
54. Widener, K. (2017). *Financial management issues of college-aged students: Influences and consequences.* <http://firescholars.seu.edu/honors/63>
55. Willacy, M. (2016). *Two-way symmetric communication between public utilities and the public.* <https://scholarworks.boisestate.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi>
56. Winarso, W. (2018). *Organizational communication; a conceptual framework.* <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/325215167>
57. Woodyard, R. (2023). *Sustainable talent management.* <https://www.coursesidekick.com/management/262636>
58. Wu, A. et al. (2021). *Organizational best practices supporting mental health in the workplace.* <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/pmc8631150/>
59. Yusoff, N. & Kayode, D. (2020). *Teacher evaluation.* <https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780190264093.013.657>
60. Young, K. (2018). *The impact of progress monitoring structures on student achievement.* <https://digitalcommons.nl.edu/diss/301>
61. Zerella, S., Treuer, K. & Albrecht, S. (2017). *The influence of office layout features on employee perception of organizational culture.* <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0272494417301044>
62. Zhening, G. et al. (2022). *Impact of employees' workplace environment on employees' performance: A multi-mediation model.* <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/pmc9136218/>
63. Zlatovic, A. (2018). *Benefits of communication on the learning process.* <https://nobeexplorers.com/benefits-communication-learning-process/>
64. Zuo, Y. (2023). *Research on the innovation trend of modern enterprise management in the context of digital economy.* <https://drpress.org/ojs/index.php/fbem/article/view/5456/5274>
65. Zweni, A. (2017). *Factors affecting management of budgets at a department in the western cape government, South Africa.* <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/156958955.pdf>